Clause-mates, Phases and Two Families of Questions
Howard Lasnik
University of Maryland

Family of questions (sometimes called pair-list) readings (here abbreviated FoQ) with WHs and universal quantifiers most typically arise when the WH originates in the same clause as the universal:

(1) Who did everyone see FoQ ✓
(2) Who do you think everyone saw FoQ ✓

May (1985) presented an important analysis of some such cases, but as pointed out by Sloan (1991), it incorrectly predicts the possibility of such readings even when the universal and the WH-trace are not clause-mates:

(3) Who does everyone expect [Mary to see t]? FoQ *
(4) Who does everyone think [Mary saw t]? FoQ *

May (1977) had already noted the absence of family of questions readings in examples like (4). However, Sloan reported that May gave her examples with structures very similar to those of (3) and (4) that do allow the reading:

(5) Who does everyone expect [PRO, to see t]? FoQ ✓
(6) Who does everyone think [he, saw t]? FoQ ✓

It has long been known that clauses without overt subjects (especially infinitival clauses) do not act like full clauses with respect to a wide variety of phenomena. Postal (1974) introduced the notion ‘quasi-clause’ for some such cases and later Rizzi (1982) developed a comprehensive theory of ‘restructuring’. There is now a vast literature on this topic. Some version might cover (5). Only sporadically mentioned are situations where a bound pronominal subject makes a complement clause similarly permeable. I will explore some further constructions behaving in a similar way, especially WH-island exemption observed by Ross (1967), as illustrated in (6), and consider a possible explanation in terms of phases, based on joint work with Tom Grano.

(7) a. He told me about a book which I can't figure out [where PRO to obtain t]
b. Which books did he tell you [why he wanted to read t]
   *Mary

Grano, Thomas and Howard Lasnik. 2015. How to neutralize a finite clause boundary: Phase theory and the grammar of bound pronouns. Ms. Indiana University and University of Maryland.


